To whom it may concern,

As independent scientists, engineers, natural resource managers, recreation managers, and environmental lawyers, we feel compelled to raise a voice of warning about a proposal that could severely damage Utah Lake.

Utah Lake is the largest freshwater lake in Utah and a keystone ecosystem in western North America. The lake creates billions of dollars of value by providing world-class recreational opportunities, water rights, enhanced property values, pollution removal, local precipitation, and habitat for 50 million birds, fish, and other wildlife. Utah Lake has great historical and cultural significance as the homeland of the Timpanogos Nation and the source of food that saved the Mormon Pioneers during crop failures in 1854 and 1855. Decades of local, state, and federal restoration efforts within and around Utah Lake have resulted in ecological recovery, including declining algal blooms, removal of invasive species, recovery of the endangered June Sucker fish (downlisted in 2021), healthy sediments, and establishment of senior water rights protecting the lake level despite the ongoing megadrought.

In 2018, the Utah Lake Amendments (HB 272) weakened constitutional protection for Utah Lake, opening the lakebed to possible development. Since then, a company called Lake Restoration Solutions (LRS) has been seeking support for a proposal to build 20,000 acres of artificial islands on Utah Lake (1/5th of the lake’s surface). Here is the project website and proposal. LRS claims their project will provide “comprehensive restoration” of the lake ecosystem at no cost to the people of Utah, referencing $6.4 billion in undisclosed investments and connections with artificial islands built in Dubai. In 2021, LRS requested and received $10 million in loan guarantees from the Utah Legislature. In August of 2021, they requested $893 million in federal loans through the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Water Infrastructure Finance and Innovation Act (WIFIA) program, but they were not invited to submit a proposal.

As a group of experts, we have serious concerns about the viability of the LRS proposal, including:

1. **Intentional disregard of available science about the lake’s history, status, and trajectory:** LRS falsely claims that Utah Lake used to be deep and clear, that waves and evaporation are damaging, that sediment is heavily polluted, that algal blooms are worsening, and that the lake is deteriorating. These claims contradict virtually all scientific evidence, including the state’s ongoing Utah Lake Water Quality Study, which has been presented at events attended by LRS.

2. **Departure from the principles and methods of ecological restoration:** LRS proposes to dredge the entire lakebed, create artificial islands to house 500,000 people, split the lake into dozens of small and deep impoundments, kill all 10 million fish with rotenone, and then use mechanical water circulators to prevent thermal stratification and dead zones. These efforts do not align with restoration best practices and are likely to reverse the lake’s recovery.

3. **Unprecedented size and scope:** LRS claims that similar projects have been successfully completed elsewhere. In fact, the proposed islands would be 8-times larger than the world’s biggest dredged island (Kansai Airport), and the dredging would be 370-times larger than the largest freshwater dredging project ever completed (Hudson River Cleanup).

4. **Inadequate expertise:** Large restoration projects in sensitive ecological areas typically involve teams of researchers, engineers, legal experts, local stakeholders, and government oversight. On the ecological side, LRS has no Ph.D. scientists on their team. On the engineering and legal sides, no project of this scope has been completed anywhere in the world.

5. **False claims of endorsement and permitting:** To reassure local and state leaders, LRS has claimed to have endorsement, permitting, or financing from the EPA, Army Corps of Engineers, FFSL, Utah Governor’s Office, Utah Legislature, and the Utah Lake Commission. We have heard from most of these entities, none of which have endorsed the project.

6. **Flawed model:** LRS’ chief design director Robert Scott designed the failed “Palm Deira” in Dubai, which appears to be the inspiration for this project. Even with nearly unlimited money from the Sheikh of Dubai, the island developer Nakheel incurred tens of billions of dollars in debt, only completing 1 of 4
planned archipelagos. Even the partial construction of those islands created massive ecological damage including creation of algal blooms, degradation of water quality, erosion of coastlines, and asphyxiation of sea life. The proposed Utah Lake islands would be 14-times larger than the only completed island project in Dubai (Palm Jumeirah).

7. **Legal and permitting barriers:** The LRS proposal depends on the largest privatization of sovereign state land in Utah history. While the 2018 *Utah Lake Amendments* make this theoretically possible, the transfer would likely result in judicial challenges based on the [public trust doctrine](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Public_trustdoctrine). Utah courts have policed this doctrine strictly, including a 2019 clarification by the Utah Supreme Court (*USAC v. VR Acquisitions*). At the federal level, this project would be the largest destruction of lake and wetland habitat in modern U.S. history. The islands would cover 1/5th of the lake area, and the dredging to build them would impact the entire lake and surrounding shoreline (at least 150 square miles). *The Environmental Impact Statement* would likely take more than a decade before being rejected given the requirements of the National Environmental Policy Act, Clean Water Act, and the Rivers and Harbors Appropriation Act.

8. **Shifting liability:** The LRS proposal imposes enormous economic and environmental risk on the citizens of Utah while providing no opportunity for reward. Project failure during design or permitting would leave the state with loan guarantees and reduced credibility regarding management of sovereign state lands. Project failure during construction or development would leave the people of Utah with a multi-billion-dollar cleanup and decades of lost restoration and recreation potential. Even the unlikely prospect of project completion would create a permanently diminished lake stripped of the natural characteristics that have sustained its ongoing recovery.

We urge local, state, and federal leaders to oppose this project and make whatever changes are necessary to prevent similar projects in the future. The 2018 *Utah Lake Amendments* and continued state support of this project damage Utah’s credibility and amplify LRS’ efforts to spread misinformation about the status and recovery of Utah Lake. Their claims have influenced public perception and shaped the political debate over Utah Lake, undermining legitimate restoration and education efforts.

In this time of dramatic change, we need evidence-based management and legislation to protect this unique, beautiful, and dynamic lake. Utah Lake has sustained our predecessors and ancestors for thousands of years. It is now our opportunity and responsibility to sustain Utah Lake for future generations.

Sincerely,

The undersigned

Benjamin W. Abbott  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science
Byron Adams  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science
Kurt Anderson  Ph.D., University of California, Riverside, Ecology/environmental science
Michelle Baker  Ph.D., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science
Mark C. Belk  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science
Patrick Belmont  Ph.D., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science
Peter Billman  M.S., University of Connecticut, Ecology/environmental science
Cassandra Bingham  M.S. candidate, Utah Valley University, social impact
Maria Blevins  Ph.D., Utah Valley University, Recreation/community design
Stephen Bloch  J.D., Legal director for the Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance, Policy/law
Hope Braithwaite  M.S., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science
M. Syndonia Bret-Harte  Ph.D., University of Alaska Fairbanks, Ecology/environmental science
Brook B. Britt  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Geology/physical science
Rachel Buck  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science
Eddy Cadet  Ph.D., Utah Valley University, NEHA, Ecology/environmental science
Greg Carling  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Geology/physical science
Katrina Catalano  Ph.D. candidate, Rutgers University, Ecology/environmental science
Chad Chorniak  Owner/Operator Timpanogos Yacht Club, Recreation/community design
Jon Chorover
Ph.D., University of Arizona, Ecology/environmental science

Charles Andrew Cole
Ph.D., Penn State, Ecology/environmental science

Marc Coles-Ritchie
Ph.D., Mormon Environmental Stewardship Alliance, botany

Marilee Coles-Ritchie
Ph.D., Westminster College, Indigenous/traditional ecological knowledge

Lafe Conner
Ph.D., Wasatch High School, Ecology/environmental science

Brigham Daniels
J.D., Ph.D., Brigham Young University Law School, Policy/law

Madison Drew Daniels
B.A., Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance, Worked for the Utah Lake Commission

Paula Dean
B.A., Restoration Ecology, Ecology/environmental science

Tim Demko
Ph.D., Arizona State Land Department (retired), Geology/physical science

Steven H. Emerman
Ph.D., Owner, Malach Consulting, LLC, Geology/physical science

Katherine M. Enberg
M.S., Natural Resource Management Wildlife Biology

Dr. Joanna Endter-Wada
Ph.D., Utah State University, Policy/law

Isabella M. Errigo
M.S. candidate, Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

Courtney Flint
Ph.D., Utah State University, Natural Resource Social Science

Andrew P. Follett
J.D. candidate, Yale Law School, Policy/law

Paul Frandsen
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Molecular ecology

Rebecca Frei
B.S., University of Alberta, Ecology/environmental science

Dawson Furner
B.S., UVU Outdoor Adventure Center, Ecology/environmental science

Mehran Ghandehari
Ph.D., Engineering

Gordon Gianniny
M.S. candidate, Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

Richard Gill
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

Dr. Fredric R. Govedich
Ph.D., Southern Utah University, Ecology/environmental science

Amelia Grose
Ph.D. candidate, Michigan State University, Ecology/environmental science

Emma Haines
M.S., California State University, Monterey Bay, Geology/physical science

Dr Neil C Hansen
PhD, Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

James G. Harris
Ph.D., Professor Emeritus, Utah Valley University, Ecology/environmental science

William Heyborne
Ph.D., Southern Utah University, Ecology/environmental science

Katelyn Hickman
B.S., Utah Valley University, Ecology/environmental science

Sophie Hill
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

Sarah Hinners
Ph.D., University of Utah, Ecology/environmental science

Daniel Horns
Ph.D., Utah Valley University, Geology/physical science

Heidi M Hoven
Ph.D., Non-profit conservation organization, Ecology/environmental science

Joel C. Janetski
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, History/culture

Erin Fleming Jones
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

Karim M Kettenring
Ph.D., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

Roger T. Koide
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

Kelly Kopp
Ph.D., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

Kevin Landom
M.S., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

Gabriella Lawson
M.S., Ecology/environmental science

Bremen Leak
M.B.A., Brigham Young University, Change management/communications

Raymond Mark Lee
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science

Josh LeMonte
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Geology/physical science

Audrey McCombs
Ph.D. candidate, Iowa State University, Ecology/environmental science

John McLaren
M.S., Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

LaVere Merritt
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Engineering

Nancy O Mesner
M.S.E., M.S., Utah State University, Policy/law

Jessica Murray
Ph.D. candidate, Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

Stephen T. Nelson
Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Geology/physical science

Daren T Nelson
Ph.D., Utah Valley University, Geology/physical science

Sarah Null
PhD, Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science

Jonathan O'Donnell
Ph.D., Ecology/environmental science

Elizabeth Perkin
Ph.D., Ecology/environmental science
Kara Kawakami Petty  B.S., Contractor, Archaeology
Joel Podgorski  Ph.D., Swiss Federal Institute of Aquatic Science and Technology, Ecology
Thomas M. Power  Ph.D., Economics Department, University of Montana, Economics/financing/business
Dr. Jani Radebaugh  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Geology/physical science
Dustin Ranglack  Ph.D., University of Nebraska at Kearney, Ecology/environmental science
Lis Regula  Ph.D., Ecological Society of America, Ecology/environmental science
Kimberly Reynolds  B.S., UVU OAC Program Director, Recreation/community design
David C. Richards  Ph.D., Oreohelix Ecological, Ecology/environmental science
Donna Rizzo  Ph.D., University of Vermont, Engineering
Keryn Ross  M.S., Brigham Young University, Geology/physical science
Joshua Roundy  Ph.D., University of Kansas, Geology/physical science
Sam Rushforth  Ph.D., Owner, Manager, Rushforth Phycology, Ecology/environmental science
John C Schmidt  Ph.D., Utah State University, Geology/physical science
Michael T. Searcy  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Indigenous/traditional ecological knowledge
Jake M. Serago, P.E.  M.S., Professional Engineer, Engineering
Erin C. Seybold  Ph.D., University of Kansas, Ecology/environmental science
Kevin Shurtleff  Ph.D., Utah Valley University, Ecology/environmental science
Andrew South  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Engineering
John R. Spear  Ph.D., Colorado School of Mines, Ecology/environmental science
Lee Stanish  Ph.D., University of Colorado, Ecology/environmental science
Sam StClair  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecological Society of America, Ecosystem ecology
Dan Stephen  Ph.D., Utah Valley University, Geology/physical science
Ryan Stewart  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science
Nancy Van Wagoner  Ph.D., Thompson Rivers University, Geology/physical science
Kathryn Van Wagoner  Ph.D., Weber State University, Education
Sara Wall  M.S., Utah State University, Geology/physical science
Weihong Wang  Ph.D., Utah Valley University, Ecology/environmental science
Samuel A Wells  Ph.D., Southern Utah University, Freshwater Biologist
Clayton White  Ph.D., Brigham Young University, Ecology/environmental science
Dr. C. David Whiteman  Ph.D., University of Utah, Geology/physical science
Dr. Peter R Wilcock  Ph.D., Utah State University, Geology/physical science
Dr. Wayne Wurtsbaugh  Ph.D., Professor Emeritus, Utah State University, Ecology/environmental science
Jay Zarnetske  Ph.D., Michigan State University, Geology/physical science

In addition to these 103 public signatories, 8 additional experts in lake ecology, water resources, recreation management, or atmospheric science signed anonymously because of employer restrictions or political considerations.